

Answer to Question

Hadiths on the Division of the Ummah

To: Muhsin Al-I'thamat

Question:

Bismillah Ar-Rahman Ar-Raheem

Our Amir, may Allah protect you, Assalam Alaikum wa Rahmatullah wa Barakatuhu. I spent a lot of effort to find the narration of the Hadith on the Ummah's division in its second version (riwaya) which mentions "all in Paradise except one"; I read this narration that was authenticated by Al-Hakim as Ghareeb in expression, and Al-Maqdasi said about it that it is more authentic than the narration of "all are in the fire except one" which is more famous. If you have the time please guide me, and May Allah bless your knowledge and your time.

Our Ameer, regarding the phrase "authenticated by Al-Hakim", it appeared in the book *Kashf Al-Kahfa* p. 150 by Al-Ajlouni and it reads "Narrated by Ash-Sha'rani in *Al-Mizan* from the Hadeeth of Ibn An-Najjar. It was authenticated by Al-Hakim as Ghareeb in expression, which is: **«سَتَفْتَرِقُ أُمَّتِي عَلَى نِيفٍ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً، كُلُّهَا فِي الْجَنَّةِ إِلَّا وَاحِدَةً»**, **"My Ummah will split into more than seventy sects, all will be in Paradise except one"**. In Ad-Dailamy's narration: **«الهِالِكُ مِنْهَا وَاحِدَةٌ»** **"One of them will perish."** The scholars said: They are the Zanadiqa (heretics). I know that the extra words **"Az-Zanadiqa"** is Mawdu' (falsely added), but what I want to know is where did Al-Hakim authenticate the narration without the extra addition of **"Az-Zanadiqa"**?

Answer:

Wa Alaikum Assalam Wa Rahmatullah Wa Barakatuh,

First: As for your question about the Ummah's division, what is narrated from Hadiths on this subject are three categories:

- 1- The one that mentions the Ummah's division into seventy-three sects.
- 2- The one that mentions the seventy-three with the addition; "all in the fire except one"
- 3- The one that mentions the seventy-three with the addition; "all in Paradise except one"

As for the first category, i.e., the Hadith without any addition, it is authentic, and I have not seen anyone classifying it as weak as far as I know:

In the Sunnan of Abu Daud that Abu Huraira said: that the Messenger of Allah (saw) said: «افْتَرَقَتِ الْيَهُودُ عَلَى إِحْدَى أَوْ ثِنْتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً وَتَفَرَّقَتِ النَّصَارَى عَلَى إِحْدَى أَوْ ثِنْتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً وَتَفْتَرِقُ أُمَّتِي عَلَى ثَلَاثٍ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً» **"The Jews were divided into seventy-one or seventy-two sects as were the Christians. My Ummah will be divided into seventy-three sects."**

In the Sunnan of Tirmithi from Abu Huraira that Messenger of Allah (saw) said: «تَفَرَّقَتِ الْيَهُودُ عَلَى إِحْدَى أَوْ ثِنْتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً وَالنَّصَارَى مِثْلَ ذَلِكَ وَتَفْتَرِقُ أُمَّتِي عَلَى ثَلَاثٍ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً» **"The Jews were divided into seventy-one or seventy-two sects as were the Christians. My Ummah will be divided into seventy-three sects."**

In Al-Bab from Saad and Abdullah bin Amr and Auf bin Malik that Abu Isa said: the Hadith of Abu Huraira is Hassan Sahih.

In Al-Mustadrak by Al-Hakim from Abu Huraira that he said, the Messenger of Allah (saw) said: **«افْتَرَقَتِ الْيَهُودُ عَلَى إِحْدَى أَوْ ثِنْتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً، وَافْتَرَقَتِ النَّصَارَى عَلَى إِحْدَى أَوْ ثِنْتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً، وَتَفْتَرِقُ أُمَّتِي عَلَى ثَلَاثٍ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً»** **"The Jews were divided into seventy-one or seventy-two sects as were the Christians. My Ummah will be divided into seventy-three sects."**

He said that this is an authentic (Sahih) Hadith based on Muslim's conditions, and they did not extract it, and it has witnesses (i.e., it was narrated by other companions)... Az-Zahabi agreed with him.

As for the second category with the addition "all in the fire except one", many narrations confirm that it is Sahih and Hassan:

- Tirmidhi narrated in his Sunnan: Mahmoud bin Ghailan told us, Abu Daud Al-Hafri told us that Sufyan al-Thawri from Abd Al-Rahman bin Ziyad Al-Afriqi from Abd Allah bin Yazeed from Abd Allah bin 'Amr that he said: The Messenger of Allah (saw) said: «... وَإِنَّ بَنِي إِسْرَائِيلَ تَفَرَّقَتْ عَلَى ثِنْتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ مِلَّةً وَتَفْتَرِقُ أُمَّتِي عَلَى ثَلَاثٍ وَسَبْعِينَ مِلَّةً كُلُّهُمْ فِي النَّارِ إِلَّا مِلَّةً وَاحِدَةً قَالُوا وَمَنْ هِيَ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ قَالَ مَا أَنَا عَلَيْهِ وَأَصْحَابِي» **The Children of Israel split into seventy two sects and my Ummah will split into seventy-three sects; all of whom will be in Hell except one group.**” They said: Who are they, O Messenger of Allah? He said: (Those who follow) that which I and my companions follow.” Abu Isa said it is a Hasan and Ghareeb Hadith.

Ibn Majah extracted in his Sunnan: Amr bin Othman bin Said bin Katheer bin Dinar Al-Homsî told us, Abad bin Yusuf told us, Safwan bin Amr told us from Rashid bin Saad from Auf bin Malik that he said: the Messenger of Allah (saw) said: «افْتَرَقَتِ الْيَهُودُ عَلَى إِحْدَى وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً فَوَاحِدَةٌ فِي الْجَنَّةِ وَسَبْعُونَ فِي النَّارِ وَافْتَرَقَتِ النَّصَارَى عَلَى ثِنْتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً فِاحِدٌ فِي النَّارِ وَوَاحِدَةٌ فِي الْجَنَّةِ وَالَّذِي نَفْسُ مُحَمَّدٍ بِيَدِهِ لَتَفْتَرِقَنَّ أُمَّتِي عَلَى ثَلَاثٍ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً وَاحِدَةً فِي الْجَنَّةِ وَثِنْتَانِ وَسَبْعُونَ فِي النَّارِ قِيلَ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ مَنْ هُمْ قَالَ الْجَمَاعَةُ» **The Children of Israel split into seventy one sects; one in Paradise and seventy in Hellfire. And the Christians split into seventy-two sects; seventy-one in Hellfire and one in Paradise. By the one whose my soul is in hands, my Ummah will split into seventy-three sects; one group will be in Paradise and seventy-two will be in Hellfire.** They said: Who are they, O Messenger of Allah? He said: The Jamma'ah.”

Ahmad extracted in his Musnad: Abu Al-Mughira said, Safwan told us, he said, Azhar bin Abdullah Al-Hawzni told me that Abu Al-Mughira in the place of Al-Harazai from Abu Amir Abdullah bin Luhai who said went to Hajj with Muawiya bin Abu Sufyan, when we approached Mecca, he prayed the noon prayer, and told us that the Messenger of Allah (saw) said: «إِنَّ أَهْلَ الْكِتَابَيْنِ افْتَرَقُوا فِي دِينِهِمْ عَلَى ثِنْتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ مِلَّةً وَإِنَّ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةَ سَتَفْتَرِقُ عَلَى ثَلَاثٍ وَسَبْعِينَ مِلَّةً يَعْنِي الْأَهْوَاءَ كُلُّهَا فِي النَّارِ إِلَّا وَاحِدَةً وَهِيَ الْجَمَاعَةُ» **The Messenger of Allah (saw) said: “Those who came before you of the people of the Book split into seventy-two sects, and this Ummah will split into seventy-three: seventy-two in Hell and one in Paradise, and that is the Jamaa'ah (main body of Muslims).”**

At-Tabarani extracted in *As-Saghir*: Isa Bin Muhammad As-Simsar Al-Wasiti told us, Wahab Bin Bakiya told us, Abdullah Bin Sufyan Al-Madani told us, from Yahya Bin Saeed Al-Ansari from Anas Bin Malik who said: The Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him and his family and companions) said: «تَفْتَرِقُ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةُ عَلَى ثَلَاثٍ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً كُلُّهُمْ فِي النَّارِ إِلَّا وَاحِدَةً، وَمَا أَنَا عَلَيْهِ» **This Ummah will split into seventy-three sects; all of whom will be in Hell except one group.**” They said: Who are they, O Messenger of Allah? He said: (Those who follow) that which I and my companions follow.” Only Abdullah Bin Sufyan narrated it from Yahya.

Al-Bayhaqi narrated in *Dala'il An-Nubuwa*: Abu al-Husain bin Al-Fadl Al-Qattan told us, Abdullah bin Jaafar Al-Nahawi told us, Ya'qub bin Sufyan told us, Abu al-Yaman told us, Safwan told us, from Al-Azhar bin Abdullah, on the authority of Abu Amir Abdullah bin Luhai that he said: We went to Hajj with Muawiya, when we approached Makka, he prayed zhuhur, and said: The Messenger of Allah (saw) said: «إِنَّ أَهْلَ الْكِتَابِ افْتَرَقُوا فِي دِينِهِمْ عَلَى اثْنَتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ مِلَّةً، وَإِنَّ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةَ سَتَفْتَرِقُ عَلَى ثَلَاثٍ وَسَبْعِينَ مِلَّةً يَعْنِي الْأَهْوَاءَ، كُلُّهَا فِي النَّارِ إِلَّا وَاحِدَةً، وَهِيَ الْجَمَاعَةُ» **Those who came before you of the people of the Book split into seventy-two sects, and this ummah will split into seventy-three: seventy-two in Hell and one in Paradise, and that is the Jamaa'ah (main body of Muslims).**”

Al-Hakim narrated in *Al-Mustadrak* on the two Sahihs: Abu Al-Abbas, Muhammad bin Ya'qub told us, from Muhammad bin Ishaq As-Saghani, from Abu Al-Yaman, Al-Hakam Bin Nafi 'al-Bahrani, from Safwan bin Amr, from Al-Azhar Bin Abd-Allah, from Abi Amir Abdullah Bin Luhai, that he said, we went to Hajj with Muawiyah bin Abi Sufyan, he got up and prayed zhuhur in Makka, he said: The Prophet (saw) said: «إِنَّ أَهْلَ الْكِتَابِ تَفَرَّقُوا فِي دِينِهِمْ عَلَى اثْنَتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ مِلَّةً، وَتَفْتَرِقُ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةُ عَلَى ثَلَاثٍ وَسَبْعِينَ مِلَّةً كُلُّهَا فِي النَّارِ إِلَّا وَاحِدَةً وَهِيَ الْجَمَاعَةُ...» **The people of the Book split over their religion into seventy-two sects, and my ummah will divide into seventy-three sects; all of them will be in the Fire except for one, and that is the Jamā'ah.**”

Al-Hakim said these narrations (chain of transmission) are proofs to answer the argument on the authenticity of this Hadith, Az-Zahabi agreed with him.

Abu Daud narrated in his Sunan: Ahmad bin Hanbal and Muhammad ibn Yahya told us, Abu Al-Mughirah told us, Safwan told us, and Amr bin Othman told us, Baqiya told us, he said, Safwan told me something similar, he said Azhar bin Abdullah Al-Harazi told me from Ubai Amir Al-Hawzni, from Muawiya ibn Abi Sufyan, that addressed us and said: The Messenger of Allah (saw) addressed us

and said: «أَلَا إِنَّ مَنْ قَبْلَكُمْ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْكِتَابِ افْتَرَقُوا عَلَى ثِنْتَيْنِ وَسَبْعِينَ مِلَّةً، وَإِنَّ هَذِهِ الْمِلَّةَ سَتَفْتَرِقُ عَلَى ثَلَاثٍ وَسَبْعِينَ: ثِنْتَانِ وَسَبْعُونَ»
Those who came before you of the people of the Book split into seventy-two sects, and this Ummah will split into seventy-three: seventy-two in Hell and one in Paradise, and that is the Jamaa'ah (main body of Muslims).” [Al-Albani classified it as Hassan]

And the third category with the addition of "all in Paradise except one group"; this narration is classified as weak by many including:

- Al-Aqeeli in “Ad-Dhu’afa’ Al-Kabeer”

Muhammad bin Marwan Al-Qurashi said: Muhammad bin Ubada Al-Wasiti said: Musa bin Ismail Al-Jabali said: Mu’az bin Yasin Az-Zayat said: Al-Abrad bin Abi Al-Ashras, said from Yahya bin, from Anas bin Malik, may Allah be pleased with him, he said: the Prophet (saw) said: «تَفْتَرِقُ أُمَّتِي عَلَى سَبْعِينَ أَوْ إِحْدَى وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً، كُلُّهُمْ فِي الْجَنَّةِ إِلَّا فِرْقَةً وَاحِدَةً، قَالُوا: يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ، مَنْ هُمْ؟ قَالَ: الزَّنَادِقَةُ وَهُمْ الْقَدَرِيَّةُ»
“My Ummah will split into seventy or seventy-one sects; all will be in Paradise, except one’ They said: ‘Who are they, O Messenger of Allah?’ He said: ‘Az-Zanadiqa and they are Al-Qadariyah.”

Al-Aqeeli said Mu’az bin Yasin Az-Zayat from Al-Abrad bin Al-Ashras is an unknown man and his speech is not memorized.

- Al-Aqeeli also narrated in “Ad-Dhu’afa’ Al-Kabeer”

Al-Hasan bin Ali bin Khalid Al-Laithi said: Na’im bin Hammad said: Yahya bin Yaman said, from Yasin Az-Zayat, from Sa’d bin Saeed, the brother of Yahya bin Saeed Al-Ansari from Anas that he said, the Messenger of Allah said: «تَفْتَرِقُ أُمَّتِي عَلَى بَضْعٍ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً، كُلُّهَا فِي الْجَنَّةِ إِلَّا فِرْقَةً وَاحِدَةً، وَهِيَ الزَّنَادِقَةُ»
“My Ummah will split into seventy-two sects, all will be in Paradise, except one, Az-Zanadiqa.”

Al-Aqeeli said: this Hadith cannot be referred to for its authenticity, and perhaps Yassin took it from his father or from Al-Abrad. This Hadith has no origin from the Hadith of Yahya Bin Saeed or from the Hadith of Sa’d.

In Al-Maudow’at of Ibn Al-Jawzi (1/267) - the book of As-Sunnah Wa Tham Al-Bida’ - the section of the division of this Ummah:

Abd Al-Wahhab Bin Al-Mubaarak said that Ibn Bakran said that Ibn Al-Atiqi said that Muhammad ibn Marwan Al-Qurashi said: Muhammad Bin Ubadah Al-Wasiti said to us: Musa Bin Ismail said to us, Mu’az Bin Yasin Az-Zayyat said to us, Al-Abrad Bin Al-Ashras from Yahya Bin Saeed from Anas Bin Malik said: The Messenger of Allah (saw): «تَفْتَرِقُ أُمَّتِي عَلَى سَبْعِينَ أَوْ إِحْدَى وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً كُلُّهُمْ فِي الْجَنَّةِ إِلَّا فِرْقَةً وَاحِدَةً»
“My Ummah will split into seventy or seventy-one sects, all will be in Paradise, except one’, They said: ‘Who are they, O Messenger of Allah?’ He said: ‘Az-Zanadiqa and they are Al-Qadariyah.”

It was narrated by Ahmad Bin Uday Al-Hafiz from the Hadith of Musa Bin Ismael from Bin Yassin and Al-Abrad.

The second chain: Abd Al-Wahhab said that Ibn Bakran said that Al-Atiqi told us, Yusuf bin Ad-Dakhil said, Al-Aqili said, Al-Hassan Bin Ali Bin Khalid Al-Laithi said, Na’im Bin Hammad told us Yahya bin Yaman told us, from Yasin Az-Zayat from Sa’d Bin Saeed brother of Yahya Bin Saeed Al-Ansari from Anas, he said: The Messenger of Allah (saw) said: «تَفْتَرِقُ أُمَّتِي عَلَى بَضْعٍ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً كُلُّهَا فِي الْجَنَّةِ إِلَّا فِرْقَةً وَاحِدَةً وَهِيَ الزَّنَادِقَةُ»
“My Ummah will split into seventy-two sects; all will be in Paradise, except one, Az-Zanadiqa.

The Third chain: Al-Jariri said: Al-’Ushari told us, Ad-Darqutni told us, Abu Bakr Muhammad Bin Uthman As-Saydalani said, Ahmad Bin Daud As-Sajistani said, Uthman bin Affan Al-Qurashi said: Abu Ismail Al-Ayli said: Hafs Bin Umar from Mis’ar from Sa’d Bin Saeed said: I heard Anas Bin Malik say: The Messenger of Allah (saw) said: «تَفْتَرِقُ أُمَّتِي عَلَى بَضْعٍ وَسَبْعِينَ فِرْقَةً كُلُّهَا فِي الْجَنَّةِ إِلَّا الزَّنَادِقَةَ»
“My Ummah will split into seventy-two sects; all will be in Paradise, except one, Az-Zanadiqa.

Anas said, we believed they were Al-Qadariyah.

These Hadiths cannot be from the Messenger of Allah (saw); there is weakness in each of the narrations in one or more places, as follows:

-Ibn Al-Jawzi in Al-Mawdhu’at mentioned the three narrations above and then he said:

“The experts in the field said: Al-Abrad (who is one of the men mentioned in the first chain) was a liar and fabricator; Yasin narrated from him, and the narration was changed and he mixed it up and was stolen by Uthman Bin Affan (who is one of the narrators in the third chain above)

Regarding Al-Abrad, Muhammad Bin Ishaq Bin Khuzaymah said that he is a liar and a fabricator.

As for Yasin (one of the narrators in second chain), Yahya said about him: "His speech is insignificant." An-Nasa'i said: "The Hadith will not be considered (Matrook)"

Regarding Uthman, the scholars of narrations said; the Matrook Hadith (not considered) is not permitted to be written except for learning (its example).

As for Hafs Bin Umar (a narrator in the third chain), Abu Hatim Ar-Razi said about him, "He was a liar", and Al-Aqili said that he fabricates what the scholars say)

In Lisan Al-Mizan by Ibn Hajr Al-Asqalani

362- Abrad Bin Ashras- from Yahya Bin Saeed Al-Ansari...

Ibn Khuzayma said: "he is a liar and a fabricator."

Therefore the addition of " all in Paradise except for one) is incorrect.

Second: As for what you mentioned in your question; (Al-Hakim authenticated it as Ghareeb in expression, which is: "كلها في الجنة إلا واحدة" "ستفترق أمتي على نيف وسبعين فرقة كلها في الجنة إلا واحدة") **"My ummah will split into more than seventy sects, all in Paradise except one"**)

I did not find this correction by Al-Hakim, as far as I know; however, even if what you mention is found somewhere that I am not aware of, or I did not see, it will not stand strong in front of the authenticators who said that this addition (to the Hadith) is weak.

Third: In conclusion, the Hadith of the division of the Ummah into seventy-three sects without the additions is correct... and that the first addition: "كلها في النار إلا واحدة" **"All in the Fire, except one"** it was classified as Hassan by many. As for the second edition: "كلها في الجنة إلا واحدة" **"All in Paradise except one"**, it was classified as weak by many, and those who said that it is Sahih or Hassan are few. Therefore my opinion (tarjeeh) is that the addition that should be considered is: "كلها في النار إلا واحدة" **"All in the Fire, except one"**, the other addition: "كلها في الجنة إلا واحدة" **"...all in Paradise; except one"** it should not be taken according to the narrations on both additions mentioned above. This is what I find most proponent and Allah knows best.

Your brother,

Ata Bin Khalil Abu Al-Rashtah

24 Rabi' Al-Akhir 1439 AH

11/1/2018 CE

The link to the answer from the Ameer's Facebook page:

<https://web.facebook.com/AmeerhtAtabinKhalil/photos/a.122855544578192.1073741828.122848424578904/753035758226831/?type=3&theater>

The link to the answer from the Ameer's page on Google Plus:

<https://plus.google.com/u/0/b/100431756357007517653/100431756357007517653/posts/Sv1uAAwe15z>

The link to the answer from the Ameer's page on Twitter:

<https://twitter.com/ataabualrashtah/status/952489890658340864>